

## GLENN HEGAR TEXAS COMPTROLLER OF PUBLIC ACCOUNTS

P.O. Box 13528 • Austin, TX 78711-3528

May 26, 2016

AMENDED CERTIFICATION

Reggy Spencer Superintendent Colorado City Independent School District P.O. Box 1268 Colorado City, Texas 79512

Dear Superintendent Spencer:

This application (Application #1042) was originally submitted on November 9, 2014, to the Colorado City Independent School District (the school district) by Luminant Generation Company LLC (the applicant) for a limitation on appraised value under the provisions of Tax Code Chapter 313<sup>[1]</sup>. On January 16, 2015, the Comptroller issued written notice that the applicant submitted a completed application; and later issued a Certificate for a limitation on appraised value on April 14, 2015. The applicant and school district executed an agreement for a limitation on appraised value (the agreement) on June 8, 2015.

On May 13, 2016, the Comptroller received an amendment to the agreement. This presents the Comptroller's review of that amendment per Section 10.2 of the agreement and determinations required:

- 1) under Section 313.025(h) to determine if the property meets the requirements of Section 313.024 for eligibility for a limitation on appraised value under Chapter 313, Subchapter C; and
- 2) under Section 313.025(d), to issue a certificate for a limitation on appraised value of the property and provide the certificate to the governing body of the school district or provide the governing body a written explanation of the comptroller's decision not to issue a certificate, using the criteria set out in Section 313.026.

### **Determination required by 313.025(h)**

The information provided by the applicant related to eligibility has not changed and therefore, the Comptroller has determined that the property meets the requirements of Section 313.024 for eligibility for a limitation on appraised value under Chapter 313, Subchapter C.

#### Certificate decision required by 313.025(d)

Determination required by 313.026(c)(1)

Based on the amended information provided by the applicant, the Comptroller has determined that the project proposed by the applicant is reasonably likely to generate tax revenue in an amount sufficient to offset the school district maintenance and operations ad valorem tax revenue

<sup>[1]</sup> All statutory references are to the Texas Tax Code, unless otherwise noted.

lost as a result of the agreement before the 25th anniversary of the beginning of the limitation period. See Attachment B.

Determination required by 313.026(c)(2)

The information provided by the applicant related to the limitation on appraised value as a determining factor has not changed and therefore, the Comptroller has determined that the applicant meets the requirement.

Based on these determinations, the Comptroller issues a certificate for a limitation on appraised value for the amendment.

The Comptroller's review of the application assumes the accuracy and completeness of the statements in the application. If the application is approved by the school district, the applicant shall perform according to the provisions of the Texas Economic Development Act Agreement (Form 50-826) executed with the school district. The school district shall comply with and enforce the stipulations, provisions, terms, and conditions of the agreement, applicable Texas Administrative Code and Chapter 313, per TAC 9.1054(i)(3).

This certificate is no longer valid if the application is modified, the information presented in the application changes, or the limitation agreement does not conform to the application. Additionally, this certificate is contingent on the school district approving and executing the amendment to the agreement by December 31, 2016.

Should you have any questions, please contact Korry Castillo, Director, Data Analysis & Transparency, by email at korry.castillo@cpa.texas.gov or by phone at 800-531-5441, ext. 3-3806, or direct in Austin at 512-463-3806.

Sincerely

Deputy Comptroller

Enclosure

cc: Korry Castillo

# Attachment A – Economic Impact Analysis

This following tables summarizes the Comptroller's economic impact analysis of Luminant Generation Company, LLC (the project) applying to Colorado Independent School District (the district), as required by Tax Code, 313.026 and Texas Administrative Code 9.1055(d)(2).

Table 1 is a summary of investment, employment and tax impact of Luminant Generation Company, LLC.

Table 1 is a summary of investment, employment and tax impact of Luminant	
	Luminant
Applicant	Generation Co.,
Applicant	LLC
Tay Code 212 024 Elicibility Catagory	Renewable Energy  - Solar
Tax Code, 313.024 Eligibility Category	- 50iai
School District	Colorado ISD
October 2015 Enrollment in School District	1031
County	Mitchell
Qualifying Time Period	2017-2018
Proposed Total Investment in District	\$302,023,140
Proposed Qualified Investment	\$302,023,140
Limitation Amount	\$20,000,000
Number of new qualifying jobs committed to by applicant*	3
Number of new non-qualifying jobs estimated by applicant	0
Average weekly wage of qualifying jobs committed to by applicant	\$820
Minimum weekly wage required for each qualifying job by Tax Code, 313.021(5)	\$820
Minimum annual wage committed to by applicant for qualified jobs	\$42,657
Minimum weekly wage required for non-qualifying jobs	
Minimum annual wage required for non-qualifying jobs	
Investment per Qualifying Job	\$100,674,380
Estimated M&O levy without any limit (15 years)	\$25,421,341
Estimated M&O levy with Limitation (15 years)	\$5,779,289
Estimated gross M&O tax benefit (15 years)	\$19,642,052
* Applicant is requesting district to waive requirement to create minimum number of qualifying jobs pursuant to Tax Code, 313.025 (f-1).	

Table 2 is the estimated statewide economic impact of Luminant Generation Company, LLC (modeled).

		Employment		Personal Income				
Year	Direct	Indirect + Induced	Total	Direct	Indirect + Induced	Total		
2015	0	0	0	\$0	\$0	\$0		
2016	183	539	721.68	\$9,127,971	\$33,474,568	\$42,602,539		
2017	233	1,319	1552	\$14,847,971	\$83,540,701	\$98,388,672		
2018	3	54	57	\$127,971	\$13,299,763	\$13,427,734		
2019	3	9	12	\$127,971	\$8,294,881	\$8,422,852		
2020	3	(21)	-18	\$127,971	\$4,510,701	\$4,638,672		
2021	3	(32)	-29	\$127,971	\$1,703,084	\$1,831,055		
2022	3	(36)	-33	\$127,971	\$726,521	\$854,492		
2023	3	(32)	-29	\$127,971	-\$250,041	-\$122,070		
2024	3	(34)	-31	\$127,971	-\$494,182	-\$366,211		
2025	3	(11)	-8	\$127,971	-\$494,182	-\$366,211		
2026	3	(17)	-14	\$127,971	-\$860,393	-\$732,422		
2027	3	(13)	-10	\$127,971	-\$616,252	-\$488,281		
2028	3	(13)	-10	\$127,971	-\$860,393	-\$732,422		
2029	3	(13)	-10	\$127,971	-\$616,252	-\$488,281		
2030	3	(9)	-6	\$127,971	-\$616,252	-\$488,281		

Source: CPA, REMI, Luminant Generation Company, LLC

Table 3 examines the estimated direct impact on ad valorem taxes to the region if all taxes are assessed.

	Estimated Taxable Value	Estimated Taxable		Colorado ISD I&S Tax	Colorado ISD M&O	Colorado ISD M&O and I&S Tax	Mitchell County Tax	Mitchell County Hospital Dist Tax	Lone Wolf Groundwater District Tax	Estimated Total
Year	for I&S	Value for M&O		Levy	Tax Levy	Levies	Levy	Levy	Levy	Property Taxes
			Tax Rate <sup>1</sup>	0.4380	1.1700		0.4413	0.2050		110porty 2unos
2016	\$2,043,371	\$2,043,371		\$8,950	\$23,907		\$9,017	\$4,189		\$46,518
2017	\$39,563,805	\$39,563,805		\$173,289	\$462,897	\$636,186	\$174,595	\$81,105		\$900,685
2018	\$302,084,443	\$302,084,443		\$1,323,130	\$3,534,388	\$4,857,518	\$1,333,099	\$619,270	\$67,184	
2019	\$278,105,288	\$278,105,288		\$1,218,101	\$3,253,832	\$4,471,933	\$1,227,279	\$570,113	\$61,851	\$6,331,175
2020	\$254,126,340	\$254,126,340		\$1,113,073	\$2,973,278	\$4,086,352	\$1,121,460	\$520,956	\$56,518	\$5,785,285
2021	\$230,147,604	\$230,147,604		\$1,008,047	\$2,692,727	\$3,700,773	\$1,015,641	\$471,800	\$51,185	\$5,239,400
2022	\$203,169,080	\$203,169,080		\$889,881	\$2,377,078	\$3,266,959	\$896,585	\$416,495	\$45,185	
2023	\$176,190,771	\$176,190,771		\$771,716	\$2,061,432	\$2,833,148	\$777,530	\$361,189	\$39,185	
2024	\$149,212,678	\$149,212,678		\$653,552	\$1,745,788	\$2,399,340	\$658,476	\$305,884	\$33,185	
2025	\$119,234,805	\$119,234,805		\$522,248	\$1,395,047	\$1,917,296	\$526,183	\$244,430	\$26,518	
2026	\$92,257,153	\$92,257,153		\$404,086	\$1,079,409	\$1,483,495	\$407,131	\$189,126	\$20,518	
2027	\$74,279,725	\$74,279,725		\$325,345	\$869,073	\$1,194,418	\$327,796	\$152,273	\$16,520	
2028	\$65,302,522	\$65,302,522		\$286,025	\$764,040	\$1,050,065	\$288,180	\$133,870	\$14,523	\$1,486,637
2029	\$62,325,547	\$62,325,547		\$272,986	\$729,209	\$1,002,195	\$275,043	\$127,767	\$13,861	\$1,418,865
2030	\$62,348,803	\$62,348,803		\$273,088	\$729,481	\$1,002,569	\$275,145	\$127,814		
2031	\$62,372,291	\$62,372,291		\$273,191	\$729,756		\$275,249	\$127,863	\$13,872	\$1,419,930
					Total	\$34,938,049	\$9,588,409	\$4,454,145		\$49,463,825

Source: CPA, Luminant Generation Company, LLC

<sup>1</sup>Tax Rate per \$100 Valuation

Table 4 examines the estimated direct impact on ad valorem taxes to the school district and Mitchell County, with all property tax incentives sought being granted using estimated market value from the application. The project has applied for a value limitation under Chapter 313, Tax Code and tax abatement with the county and hospital district.

The difference noted in the last line is the difference between the totals in Table 3 and Table 4.

Year	Estimated Taxable Value for I&S	Estimated Taxable Value for M&O		Colorado ISD I&S Tax Levy	Colorado ISD M&O Tax Levy	Colorado ISD M&O and I&S Tax Levies	Mitchell County Tax Levy	Mitchell County Hospital Dist Tax Levy	Lone Wolf Groundwater District Tax Levy	Estimated Total Property Taxes
			Tax Rate <sup>1</sup>	0.4380	1.1700		0.4413	0.2050	0.0222	
2016	\$2,043,371	\$2,043,371		\$8,950	\$23,907	\$32,857	\$9,017	\$4,189	\$454	\$46,518
2017	\$39,563,805	\$39,563,805		\$173,289	\$462,897	\$636,186	\$174,595	\$81,105	\$8,799	\$900,685
2018	\$302,084,443	\$20,000,000		\$1,323,130	\$234,000	\$1,557,130	\$0	\$0	\$67,184	\$1,624,313
2019	\$278,105,288	\$20,000,000		\$1,218,101	\$234,000	\$1,452,101	\$0	\$0	\$61,851	\$1,513,952
2020	\$254,126,340	\$20,000,000		\$1,113,073	\$234,000	\$1,347,073	\$0	\$0	\$56,518	\$1,403,591
2021	\$230,147,604	\$20,000,000		\$1,008,047	\$234,000	\$1,242,047	\$0	\$0	\$51,185	\$1,293,231
2022	\$203,169,080	\$20,000,000		\$889,881	\$234,000	\$1,123,881	\$0	\$0	\$45,185	\$1,169,065
2023	\$176,190,771	\$20,000,000		\$771,716	\$234,000	\$1,005,716	\$0	\$0	\$39,185	\$1,044,900
2024	\$149,212,678	\$20,000,000		\$653,552	\$234,000	\$887,552	\$0	\$0	\$33,185	\$920,736
2025	\$119,234,805	\$20,000,000		\$522,248	\$234,000	\$756,248	\$0	\$0	\$26,518	\$782,766
2026	\$92,257,153	\$20,000,000		\$404,086	\$234,000	\$638,086	\$0	\$0	\$20,518	\$658,604
2027	\$74,279,725	\$20,000,000		\$325,345	\$234,000	\$559,345	\$0	\$0	\$16,520	\$575,865
2028	\$65,302,522	\$65,302,522		\$286,025	\$764,040	\$1,050,065	\$288,180	\$133,870	\$14,523	\$1,486,637
2029	\$62,325,547	\$62,325,547		\$272,986	\$729,209	\$1,002,195	\$275,043	\$127,767	\$13,861	\$1,418,865
2030	\$62,348,803	\$62,348,803		\$273,088	\$729,481	\$1,002,569	\$275,145	\$127,814	\$13,866	\$1,419,395
2031	\$62,372,291	\$62,372,291		\$273,191	\$729,756	\$1,002,946	\$275,249	\$127,863	\$13,872	\$1,419,930
				_	Total	\$15,295,996	\$1,021,980	\$474,745	\$469,351	\$16,259,127
					Diff	\$19,642,052	\$8,566,428	\$3,979,400	\$13,872	\$33,204,698
County, N	County, Midland College, and the Middle Mitchell Groundwater District.									

Source: CPA, Luminant Generation Company, LLC

<sup>1</sup>Tax Rate per \$100 Valuation

**Disclaimer:** This examination is based on information from the application submitted to the school district and forwarded to the comptroller. It is intended to meet the statutory requirement of Chapter 313 of the Tax Code and is not intended for any other purpose.

#### Attachment B – Tax Revenue over 25 Years

This represents the Comptroller's determination that Luminant Generation Co., LLC (project) is reasonably likely to generate, before the 25th anniversary of the beginning of the limitation period, tax revenue in an amount sufficient to offset the school district maintenance and operations ad valorem tax revenue lost as a result of the agreement. This evaluation is based on an analysis of the estimated M&O portion of the school district property tax levy and direct, indirect and induced tax effects from project employment and investment directly related to this project, using estimated taxable values provided in the application.

	Tax Year	Estimated ISD M&O Tax Levy Generated (Annual)	Estimated ISD M&O Tax Levy Generated (Cumulative)	Estimated ISD M&O Tax Levy Loss as Result of Agreement (Annual)	Estimated ISD M&O Tax Levy Loss as Result of Agreement (Cumulative)
Limitation	2015	\$23,671	\$23,671	\$0	\$0
Pre-Years	2016	\$23,907	\$47,578	\$0	\$0
	2017	\$462,897	\$510,475	\$0	\$0
	2018	\$234,000	\$744,475	\$3,300,388	\$3,300,388
	2019	\$234,000	\$978,475	\$3,019,832	\$6,320,220
	2020	\$234,000	\$1,212,475	\$2,739,278	\$9,059,498
	2021	\$234,000	\$1,446,475	\$2,458,727	\$11,518,225
Limitation Period	2022	\$234,000	\$1,680,475	\$2,143,078	\$13,661,303
(10 Years)	2023	\$234,000	\$1,914,475	\$1,827,432	\$15,488,735
	2024	\$234,000	\$2,148,475	\$1,511,788	\$17,000,524
	2025	\$234,000	\$2,382,475	\$1,161,047	\$18,161,571
	2026	\$234,000	\$2,616,475	\$845,409	\$19,006,979
	2027	\$234,000	\$2,850,475	\$635,073	\$19,642,052
	2028	\$764,040	\$3,614,514	\$0	\$19,642,052
Maintain Viable	2029	\$729,209	\$4,343,723	\$0	\$19,642,052
Presence	2030	\$729,481	\$5,073,204	\$0	\$19,642,052
(5 Years)	2031	\$729,756	\$5,802,960	\$0	\$19,642,052
	2032	\$730,033	\$6,532,993	\$0	\$19,642,052
	2033	\$730,314	\$7,263,307	\$0	\$19,642,052
	2034	\$730,597	\$7,993,904	\$0	\$19,642,052
	2035	\$730,883	\$8,724,787	\$0	\$19,642,052
Additional Years	2036	\$731,172	\$9,455,958	\$0	\$19,642,052
as Required by	2037	\$731,463	\$10,187,422	\$0	\$19,642,052
313.026(c)(1)	2038	\$731,758	\$10,919,180	\$0	\$19,642,052
(10 Years)	2039	\$732,056	\$11,651,235	\$0	\$19,642,052
	2040	\$732,356	\$12,383,591	\$0	\$19,642,052
	2041	\$732,660	\$13,116,251	\$0	\$19,642,052
	2042	\$732,966	\$13,849,217	\$0	\$19,642,052
		\$13,849,217	is less than	\$19,642,052	
Analysis Summary					
s the project reason as a result of the lim	nably likely	to generate tax revenue in	an amount sufficient to of	ffset the M&O levy loss	No

Source: CPA, Luminant Generation Co., LLC

		Employment			Personal Income		Revenue & Expenditure			
Year	Direct	Indirect + Induced	_Total	Direct	Indirect + Induced	Total	Revenue	Expenditure	Net Tax Effect	
2015	0	0	0	\$0	\$0			0	\$0	
2016	183	539	721.68		\$33,474,568	\$42,602,539	4493713	-1243591	\$5,737,304	
2017	233	1,319		\$14,847,971	\$83,540,701	\$98,388,672	11299133	-2197266	\$13,496,399	
2018	3	54	57	\$127,971	\$13,299,763	\$13,427,734	648499	1602173	-\$953,674	
2019	3	9	12	\$127,971	\$8,294,881	\$8,422,852	541687	1541138	-\$999,451	
2020	3	(21)	-18		\$4,510,701	\$4,638,672	396729	1419067	-\$1,022,338	
2021	3	(32)	-29	\$127,971	\$1,703,084	\$1,831,055	274658	1266479	-\$991,821	
2022	3	(36)	-33	\$127,971	\$726,521	\$854,492	205994	1113892	-\$907,898	
2023	3	(32)	-29	\$127,971	-\$250,041	-\$122,070	175476	938416	-\$762,940	
2024	3	(34)	-31	\$127,971	-\$494,182	-\$366,211	167847	801086	-\$633,239	
2025	3	(11)	-8	\$127,971	-\$494,182	-\$366,211	205994	648499	-\$442,505	
2026	3	(17)	-14	\$127,971	-\$860,393	-\$732,422	106812	534058	-\$427,246	
2027	3	(13)	-10	\$127,971	-\$616,252	-\$488,281	91553	396729	-\$305,176	
2028	3	(13)	-10	\$127,971	-\$860,393	-\$732,422	45776	289917	-\$244,141	
2029	3	(13)	-10	\$127,971	-\$616,252	-\$488,281	15259	221252	-\$205,993	
2030	3	(9)	-6	\$127,971	-\$616,252	-\$488,281	15259	122070	-\$106,811	
2031	3	(11)	-8	\$127,971	-\$860,393	-\$732,422	-30518	30518	-\$61,036	
2032	3	(7)	4	\$127,971	-\$372,112	-\$244,141	-38147	-15259	-\$22,888	
2033	3	(5)	2	\$127,971	-\$372,112	-\$244,141	-76294	-122070	\$45,776	
2034	3	(9)	-6	\$127,971	-\$860,393	-\$732,422	-137329	-183105	\$45,776	
2035	3	(13)	10	\$127,971	-\$860,393	-\$732,422	-198364	-236511	\$38,147	
2036	3	(15)	-12	\$127,971	-\$1,348,674	-\$1,220,703	-236511	-320435	\$83,924	
2037	3	(17)	-14	\$127,971	-\$2,081,096	-\$1,953,125	-274658	-404358	\$129,700	
2038	3	(19)	-16	\$127,971	-\$2,325,237	-\$2,197,266	-259399	-450134	\$190,735	
2039	3	(19)	-16	\$127,971	-\$1,592,815	-\$1,464,844	-289917	-511169	\$221,252	
2040	3	(21)	-18	\$127,971	-\$3,301,799	-\$3,173,828	-350952	-579834	\$228,882	
2041	3	(21)	-18	\$127,971	-\$2,813,518	-\$2,685,547	-396729	-640869	\$244,140	
2042	3	(24)	-21	\$127,971	-\$2,813,518	-\$2,685,547	-381470		\$274,658	
						Total	\$16,014,101	\$3,364,565	\$12,649,536	
							\$26,498,753	is greater than	\$19,642,052	
Analysis					e prompte de la companio del companio del companio de la companio del companio de la companio del companio de la companio della companio dell				of the organization	
is the proj	ect reaso igreemen	nably likely to generate?	ate tax re	venue in an a	mount sufficient to	offset the Ma	&O levy loss as	s a result of the	Yes	

Source: CPA, REMI, Luminant Generation Co., LLC

**Disclaimer:** This examination is based on information from the application submitted to the school district and forwarded to the comptroller. It is intended to meet the statutory requirement of Chapter 313 of the Tax Code and is not intended for any other purpose.